

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION **MINUTES**

August 15, 2019

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on August 15, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. at the Development Resource Center, Conference Room 1A. Chair Steve Lewin called the meeting to order. Secretary Rosetta Greer called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Committee. Chair Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Chair Steve Lewin, Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer, Matt McDonald, Hannah Forman, Skip Pond and Lee Helena.

Members Absent: Rachel Shannon

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Sarah Robbins, Secretary Rosetta Greer, City Attorney Robert Robinson.

Applicants Present: Rick Davis, Reece Davis, Ken Morris, Kenny Turner, Gary & Joyce Grace, Frank McDonald and Justin White

Approval of Minutes: Steve Lewin made a motion to approve July 2019 meeting minutes. Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #19-HZ-00088 – 4408 Seneca Avenue – New retaining wall & parking pad in front of structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Reece Davis, has applied for the following work:

- Alterations to a historic retaining wall and driveway
- New front yard parking area
- New retaining walls

There were no comments from the community.

The applicant, Rick Davis and Reece Davis presented additional information to support their case. The additional information has been added to the application packet as *Exhibit 1*.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Lee Helena made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00088: 4408 Seneca Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

- 1.) Existing new wall would be one consistent height with capstones.
- 2.) Native shrubs evergreen shall be planted at 4 feet on center along existing new 4 foot wall.
- 3.) New 2.5 feet wall as submitted will be same material with new existing wall, and have same capstones.

NEW BUSINESS:

Case #19-HZ-00083 – 5505 Alabama Avenue – New construction of primary structure, parking pad, and fence

Project Description:

The applicant, K3D Property Services, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- New walkway
- New driveway
- New privacy fence.

There were comments from the community.

Lynn Bartoletti addressed the Commission and noted that she objected to the proposed height of the primary structure.

Carolyn Cuppage addressed the Commission and noted her concerns about the foundation height and the overall height of the structure.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Melissa Mortimer made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00083: 5505 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any

and all conditions. Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The following conditions were noted in the motion: Front porch to be minimum 6 feet deep. Columns to be 6 inch by 6 inch wood with square edges. Foundation to be maximum of 3 feet high and of brick veneer. Parking pad to be extended to midpoint depth of house. Privacy fence to start at mid-point depth of house. Small 2 foot landscape wall on front. Two to one window – second floor – change porch roof slope to make work.

Case #19-HZ-00084 – 5503 Alabama Avenue – New construction of primary structure, parking pad, and fence

Project Description:

The applicant, K3D Property Services, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of primary structure
- New walkway
- New driveway
- New parking area

There were comments from the community.

Carolyn Cuppage addressed the Commission and noted her concerns for the proposed 4 foot foundation height to be allowed beyond what is recommended by the St Elmo Historic Guidelines for a maximum height of 2 foot foundation height.

Lynn Bartoletti addressed the Commission and noted her concerns for the proposed 4 foot foundation height.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00084: 5503 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Hannah Forman seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The following conditions were noted in the motion: Add a 2 foot landscape wall at front of the house. Foundation height to be a maximum of 3 feet. Parking pad to

extend to midway point of south side of the house. Upstairs windows to have 2 to 1 proportion at dormer.

Case #19-HZ-00104 – 4512 Alabama Avenue – Alterations to previously approved COA 19-HZ-00055 for rear deck baluster material.

Project Description:

The applicant, Kenny Turner, has applied for the following work:

- Replace rear deck wood baluster material with metal balusters.

There were no comments from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00104 – 4512 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Lee Helena seconded the motion. 5 in favor, 1 opposed (Melissa Mortimer), the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #19-HZ-00105 – 5401 Alabama Avenue – Demolition of entire primary structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Gary M. & Joyce Gray, has applied for the following work:

- Demolition of primary structure.

There were comments from the community.

Allison Van Winkle sent in an email to Staff in opposition to the proposed demolition. The email has been printed and filed with the application packet.

Ann Gray, the Executive Director of Cornerstone, sent in an email to Staff in opposition to the proposed demolition. The email was read at the meeting and a paper copy has been printed and filed with the application packet.

Tim McDonald, 5021 Sunnyside Avenue, sent in an email to Staff in opposition to the proposed demolition. The email was read at the meeting and a paper copy has been printed and filed with the application packet.

Cal Boroughs, of Presbyterian Church in St Elmo, sent in an email to Staff in opposition to the proposed demolition. The email was read at the meeting and a paper copy has been printed and filed with the application packet.

Lynn Bartoletti addressed the Commission in opposition to the proposed demolition.

Karen Brandon, neighboring resident, addressed the Commission in opposition to the proposed demolition.

Carolyn Cuppage addressed the Commission in opposition to the proposed demolition.

Applicant Rebuttal: Joyce rebutted that the pictures presented in the application do not adequately represent the conditions of the primary structure.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. **Melissa Mortimer** made a motion to deny Case 19-HZ-00105 – 5401 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Lee Helena seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

There were no conditions noted in the motion. The following comments were noted by **Melissa Mortimer** after the motion: Denied based on historic importance to neighborhood. Application does not show enough evidence to warrant demo. Should not approve demolitions due to deferred maintenance.

Case #19-HZ-00106 – 950 Vine Street – Retaining wall, pathways, and fenced pool

Project Description:

The applicant, Frank McDonald, has applied for the following work:

- Revisions to previously approved COA 19-HZ-00021: raise north-west pool fence to be 6' height (safety); add handicap lift at south-east corner of pool; substitute Redi-Rock "limestone" style retaining wall for brick veneer walls; add curtain pull-type visual screen around 3 sides of pool (material to be solar-screen type); clarify service road will be grass; delete handicap sidewalk from pool to court.

There were comments from the community.

Hal Baker addressed the Commission in opposition to the construction access road that is currently gravel and present on the site.

Applicant Rebuttal: Frank McDonald clarified that the lawn of the site will be restored as close as possible to the original slope and condition and the construction road is only temporary.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. **Skip Pond** made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00106 – 950 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any

and all conditions. Hannah Forman seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The following conditions were noted in the motion: Restore service road/lawn to original grade and seed to match existing/original grass.

Chair Steve Lewin recused himself from the following two cases.

Case #19-HZ-00107 – 1603 W. 57th Street – Demolition of entire primary structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Roger Patel, has applied for the following work:

- Demolition of primary structure

Justin White, representing the owner Roger Patel, addressed the Commission and stated that he would answer any questions the Commission had.

There were no comments from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Hannah Forman made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00107 – 1603 W. 57th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. 3 in favor, 2 opposed (Lee Helena and Melissa Mortimer), the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #19-HZ-00108 – 1603 W. 57th Street – New construction of primary structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Roger Patel, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of primary structure
- New concrete strip driveway
- New rear parking pad
- New side structure paver patio

There were no comments from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Lee Helena made a motion to approve Case 19-HZ-00108 – 1603 W. 57th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and

all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

There following conditions were noted in the motion: Roof pitch shall be straight and not multiple pitches in the same rafter span.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Proposed Revisions to the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission Bylaws / Rules of Procedure: City Attorney Robert Roberson noted, in summary: that, per the Historic Zoning Commission bylaws, the voting shall be deemed by the majority of the votes cast by the members present.

NEXT MEETING DATE: September 19, 2019 (application deadline is August 16, 2019 at 4 p.m.).

Melissa Mortimer made a motion to adjourn. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:35 p.m.



Steve Lewin, Chair

9-18-2019

Date



Rosetta Greer, Secretary

9-18-2019

Date